

Annex 3: Consultation Comments and Officer Responses

1. The consultation included the following elements:

Both Sites

- Erection of road signs on approaches to the sites
- City of York Council website
- Use of AccessYork.gov.uk email address
- Press release
- Internal consultation with council departments
- External consultation with interest groups and the emergency services

Askham Bar

- Distribution of a leaflet to all households in the Copmanthorpe area and to immediately neighbouring properties in Dringhouses.
- Displays at Dringhouses Library, Copmanthorpe Library, Tadcaster Road Tesco, York College, and 9 St. Leonard's Place
- A staffed exhibition at the Askham Bar Park & Ride site on 14 February (08:00 to 19:00)
- Attendance at the Rural West Ward Committee Meeting on 8 February

Poppleton Bar

- Distribution of a leaflet to all households in the Nether and Upper Poppleton Parishes and to properties fronting onto Boroughbridge Road (A59) near the Beckfield Lane junction.
- Displays at Poppleton Library, Poppleton Garden Centre and 9 St. Leonard's Place
- A staffed exhibition at All Saints Hall on 10 February (08:00 to 19:00)
- Attendance at the (special meeting) Rural West ward committee meeting on 16 February; Acomb ward committee on 15 February; and Nether Poppleton and Upper Poppleton Parish Councils on 5 March.

2. The following responses were received:

Source	Number	
	Askham Bar	Poppleton Bar
Email	37	51
Dringhouses library	5	-
Copmanthorpe library	2	-
Poppleton library	-	11
Askham Bar Exhibition	15 (66 attendees)	-
Poppleton Bar Exhibition	N/A	14 (50-60 attendees)
Letters	3	4
Telephone Calls	0	1
TOTAL	62	81

3. Askham Bar responses included 69 comments with approximately 39 separate items. Poppleton Bar responses numbered around 135 comments covering around 75 separate items
4. A more detailed list of comments and officer responses is included in the following paragraphs for the most common comments. The following tables rank the comments.

Summary of Most Common Comments – Askham Bar

Response	Frequency	Rank
Supportive of scheme	16	1
Would like to see 1 cycle crossing point for the Park & Ride access road	15	2
Suggest grade separated solution for York College pedestrian crossing	12	3
Would like pedestrian link to Tesco and existing P&R bus stop area	5	4
Retain existing Park & Ride Stops	5	4
Suggest left turn slip road is constructed immediately	5	4
Concern over what is going to happen to the existing site	3	7
Concern over right turns in	3	7
Physical appearance of junction looks	3	7

complicated on plan		
Concern that the secluded nature of the cemetery may be compromised	3	7

Supportive of Scheme

5. The highest ranked comment received was support for the scheme – showing public support for enlarging and relocating the Park & Ride site.

Officer Response

6. None needed.

Would like to see 1 cycle crossing point for the Park & Ride access road

7. Many responses raised concerns that the proposed three 'stage' crossing of the new Park & Ride access road for cyclists was a problem.

Officer Response

8. The three stage partially signalised cycle crossing was in the consultation design layouts as it offered cyclists the most direct route (with least deviation) across the Park & ride access arm under signal control.
9. The proposed solution to mitigate the issue identified in these comments is to move the cycle route crossing point further north along the Park & Ride access arm. This will enable cyclists to cross the road safely in one location. Crossing cyclists will seek gaps in the traffic flow and cross on a highly visible raised table. Visibility to seek safe gaps in traffic is improved in this area.
10. There will be slightly more deviation for the cycle route although this will be minimised through careful design.

Suggest grade separated solution for York College pedestrian crossing

11. Many respondents commented on the congestion caused by the existing pedestrian and cyclist TOUCAN crossing on

Tadcaster Road outside York College and suggested that a bridge or subway be constructed.

Officers Response

12. The council is aware of journey time delays for vehicles on Tadcaster Road caused by the frequent calling of the York College crossing and the 'throttle' that this represents at what is a physical bottleneck point for the local road network. This was modelled and validated in the traffic modelling work in the Transport Assessment for the site, submitted as part of the planning application.
13. The proposed mitigation suggested by many of constructing a grade separated solution (bridge or subway) would not be affordable within the Access York project.
14. There are likely to be engineering complexities involving the impact on existing retaining walls on both sides for construction of a subway. Third party land would also be required. The length of approach ramps needed for any bridge would require an alignment parallel to Tadcaster Road and therefore not on the pedestrian desire line – resulting in low use and continued at grade crossing of the road.
15. The mitigation proposed by the council is threefold.
16. Firstly, by removing the majority of Askham Bar Park & Ride users i.e those from the south and south west (Leeds, Copmanthorpe and Tadcaster) directions, from the traffic network via the new access junction *before* they get to York College crossing there will be a net reduction in traffic passing through the 'throttle'.
17. Secondly, measures are being investigated and discussed with the Park & Ride bus operator that would result in greater numbers of College students being transported closer to the College. This will be achieved by diverting a limited number of morning peak hour outbound Park & Ride buses down Tadcaster Road and allowing alighting on the east side of Tadcaster Road (at the existing stop close to York College).
18. Finally, it should also be noted that the Network Management team is examining ways of commuting the frequency of potential crossing demand calls (via UTC control). Any

reduction will have to be carefully planned to minimise the impact on pedestrian and cyclist safety and represent a sensible and considered compromise between conflicting demands.

Would like pedestrian link to Tesco and existing P&R bus stop area

19. A number of comments were received suggesting that a pedestrian link should be provided along the bus only lane.

Officers Response

20. The costs of providing such an additional pedestrian link are not justified given the numbers involved. The route suggested offers very little time advantage over what is already proposed and may present security concerns passing close to the rear of the Tesco store and along a relatively secluded corridor.
21. The proposed pedestrian route to Tesco via Tadcaster Road will utilise the existing well lit and well trafficked footway.
22. Boarding and alighting will be allowed at the bus stops in the existing Park & ride area.

Retain existing Park & Ride Stops

23. Many comments requested that the existing Park & Ride bus stops be retained.

Officers Response

24. Agreed – this represents a key element of the operation of the new facility and will be agreed with the bus operator.

Suggest left turn slip road is constructed immediately

25. A number of residents suggested that the left turn slip road should be constructed immediately to prevent disruption in the future.

Officers Response

26. The significant capacity benefits of the compound junction design as proposed mean that the left turn lane is unlikely to be needed in the short to medium term (next 15-20 years).

Not constructing this unnecessary feature will save around £80,000. The design of the scheme has been future proofed to enable this to be added in at a later date if needed.

Concern over what is going to happen to the existing site

27. Many residents were concerned over what was going to happen to the existing site.

Officers Response

28. The existing site will be available for sale when the new site becomes operational. The future development allocation for the site is currently being considered in the LDF process. It is anticipated that the receipt from the sale will contribute to the funding of the overall project.

Concern over right turns in

29. Many people were confused as to how exactly the right turn in to the Park & Ride site would work.

Officers Response

30. The original consultation layout showed a tightening right turn manoeuvre to be made to turn in to the site. Considering the potential for loss of control accidents and confusion the design will be amended to present a more straight forward (right angle) right turn in to the site on a constant radius, providing a smoother alignment.

Appearance of junction looks complicated on plan

31. A number of residents raised the issue of the junction appearing complex on the consultation plans.

Officers Response

32. The proposed 'compound' junction layout is common throughout the region and the UK, particularly in larger cities as it offers capacity advantages.
33. The plan layout may appear complicated but the road user will be guided through the junction with appropriate signage and lines. It is not possible to display these in the consultation layout. Conflict points are separated and simplified in time and

space as compared to conventional junctions where these areas are concentrated in the centre of the junction.

Concern that the secluded nature of the cemetery may be compromised

34. A number of residents have raised concerns about the impact on the existing cemetery (Dringhouses Burial Ground).

Officers Response

35. The environmental impact on the cemetery will be minimal. Existing trees within the cemetery will continue to provide screening. An area of the site next to the cemetery has been set aside for landscape measures and will not have car parking directly adjacent.
36. A detailed landscape plan will be developed and be supplied to the council for agreement and approval.

Summary of Most Common Comments – Poppleton Bar

Response	Frequency	Rank
Concern about through traffic in Poppleton	21	1
Supportive of scheme	17	2
Would like details of a though traffic mitigation scheme	12	3
Against scheme	10	4
Concerned about blocking back	6	5
Cinder Lane Access	5	6
Suggesting rail based Park & Ride	5	6
Too close to Rawcliffe Bar	5	6
Thinks subway is a good idea	5	6
Plant more trees on site	5	6

Concern about through traffic in Poppleton

37. A number of residents have raised concerns about the impact of through traffic in Poppleton.

Officers Response

38. The council is aware of the long standing issue of through traffic using Poppleton village to shortcut congestion and delays in the area.
39. In 2009 the council carried out a comprehensive traffic movement study in the area. This was undertaken using video surveys of vehicles at the A59 junctions and on Millfield Lane.
40. The results indicated that the majority of traffic in Poppleton (80 to 90%) originates or has a destination in Poppleton. Peak conditions for through traffic occur in the mid week evenings and amount to approx. 20% of traffic in Poppleton. Morning levels are approximately 10% of total traffic.
41. Some roads in the village (Black Dike Lane particularly) carry a higher proportion of through traffic (up to 50%), albeit absolute numbers are low. Most through traffic uses Hodgson Lane (66% inbound, 45% outbound).
42. To assist with ongoing monitoring the council installed a permanent traffic counter on Millfield Lane in Poppleton. The recent results from this show that there was a small reduction in flows between 2010 and 2011.
43. It is anticipated that the Park & Ride proposals will significantly reduce the amount of through traffic in Poppleton when operational. The reasons for this are the upgrade of the A59/A1237 junction and the shift of car trips onto Park & Ride bus. Both measures will reduce delay and congestion on the strategic routes in the area reducing the perceived time benefit of through traffic routing through Poppleton village.
44. We propose that options for addressing through traffic, safety and speeding issues in Poppleton are investigated further in advance of the Park & Ride scheme with a view to have the most significant measures in place (or designed ready for rapid delivery if required) at the start of construction.
45. Data from the traffic counter will be monitored during construction to detect if there are significant changes to through traffic in the area.

Supportive of scheme

46. The second highest ranked comment received was support for the scheme – showing public support for the new Park & Ride site.

Officer Response

47. None needed.

Would like details of a though traffic mitigation scheme

48. A number of comments were received requesting that a mitigation scheme for through traffic be developed and publicised in the village.

Officers Response

49. Temporary or permanent traffic measures for Poppleton designed to impede through traffic have been reviewed and were subject of survey in January 2010. Residents were asked to provide views on possible measures on access roads (Do Nothing, One Way (Inbound/Outbound), Traffic Calming and Road Closures).

50. Summary of Results (% of responses for each road)

- Largest response was to do nothing for Newlands Lane, Millfield Lane and Station Road (60-70%)
- Highest response for doing something was on Black Dike Lane or Hodgson Lane (70%)
- One Way outbound for Hodgson Lane or Black Dike Lane (Approx. 30% support)
- Road Closure Black Dike Lane (Approx. 20% support)
- Traffic Calming for Hodgson Lane (Approx. 20% support)

51. Constraints on the successful delivery of such a scheme include:

- No consensus locally on best option
- Most options would restrict access for local residents
- Traffic may increase on other roads

52. Following discussions with the local Parish councils the following measures are going to be investigated in more detail:
53. Station Road – Investigate parking restrictions to ensure free exit/entry to new junction.
54. Black Dike Lane – Investigate provision of a road closure or one way outbound restrictions. Temporary, Experimental or Permanent Traffic Regulation Orders to be considered – temporary or experimental would give the most flexibility during delivery.
55. Hodgson Lane – Investigate provision of gateway feature to reinforce entrance to village. Review speed surveys and investigate traffic calming measures.
56. Newlands Lane – Undertake survey to update numbers using route. Previous surveys indicated only approx. 50 vehicles in each direction in a 12 hour period with approx. 20-30% being through traffic.
57. Long Ridge Lane – Review Speed survey data and previous speed management proposals and investigate provision of traffic calming measures.
58. A59 Harrogate Road – Investigate measures to reduce speeds in the area of the proposed works.

Against scheme

59. Ten respondents indicated they were against the scheme.

Officers Response

60. The Park & Ride service is a cornerstone of the Council's transport policy to 'Get York Moving'. The sites have planning consent and the necessary funding sources have been identified.

Concerned about blocking back

61. A number of comments raised the issue of potential blocking back between the junctions of A59/Station Road and A59/A1237 roundabout.

Officers Response

62. Both junctions are being carefully designed to avoid blocking back. Halcrow are using industry standard junction assessment modelling packages to predict performance levels. The calculations predict improvements in capacity at both junctions. This is benchmarked by traffic data collected at the A19/A1237 roundabout which has shown substantial benefits following its recent improvement.
63. To avoid the situation whereby long platoons of straight ahead traffic on the A59 are delayed by the odd left turning vehicle at the junction of A59/Station Road/Northfield Lane some minor widening to provide longer flared approaches to the junction in either direction is proposed.
64. A queue detection sensor will be installed on the westbound A59 carriageway between the A1237 and Northfield Lane. When this is triggered it extends the green time of the A59 westbound ahead phase at the traffic signals, effectively dissipating any queue build up. A similar arrangement is used on the A1079/York Road junction to prevent queuing back onto Grimston Bar interchange.

Cinder Lane Access

65. Cinder Lane is a private road to the north of the A59 Boroughbridge Road. Cinder Lane and a number of other adjacent driveways in the area access directly onto the A59. Cinder Lane is located approximately 100 metres due east of the A59/A1237 roundabout.
66. As part of the roundabout works the A59/A1237 roundabout will be enlarged, which will move the eastern extent of the resulting roundabout closer to Cinder Lane than is currently the case. The A59 will be widened into the verge area to the south side of the existing carriageway on approach to the roundabout in the vicinity of Cinder Lane. This is to reduce congestion and provide an additional short length of two lane approach to the roundabout.
67. Due to the proximity of the Cinder Lane area to the roundabout the residents have voiced concerns and highlighted issues associated with the highway layouts. These are as follows:

- Concern over vehicle speeds along the A59
- Making turns into and out of driveways and Cinder Lane
- Closer proximity to the A59/A1237 roundabout
- Visibility distances
- Disruption and inconvenience during construction
- Crossing and pedestrian issues
- Access to the bus stop and garage area
- Request for traffic calming measures.

Officer Response

68. Delays and congestion at the existing A1237/A59 junction inconveniences thousands of people on a daily basis. Reducing congestion and delay will bring significant benefits to travellers in the City and across the County. This is being achieved through the improvement of the existing roundabout proposed as part of this scheme. Due to land availability and the proximity of adjacent buildings, residences and businesses the capacity of the roundabout can only be realistically improved through expansion in a north-easterly direction.
69. As the roundabout improvement scheme has developed it has been designed in accordance with best practice UK Government guidelines including the Manual for Streets, Manual for Streets2 and the Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (where appropriate). As part of the design process an independent road safety audit was carried out. This along with the design development did not reveal any existing road safety issues in the area or any safety issues as part of the proposed designs.
70. The council has engaged with the residents and business in the local area since the project re-started in a number of ways including meetings, site visits, telephone calls, emails and hand delivered and posted letters.
71. We are aware of the residents concerns and are seeking to address them in a way which can be safely and realistically incorporated into a compliant design. This work will be ongoing in many respects and we are committed to informing

the local residents of our progress. Measures identified in the consultation design for the Cinder Lane area included:

- Slewing the A59 carriageway southwards to increase visibility distances to Cinder Lane;
- Land purchase and vegetation clearance agreed with residents to increase visibility distances;
- Traffic calming road surface markings

72. The following additional measures are proposed in the current design layout to improve visibility and reduce speeds in the area.

- Pedestrian refuge island provided for crossing to the bus stop to aid crossing and create an environment with slower speeds;
- Changes to the roundabout geometry including the reduction of the A1237 southbound entry radius and A59 eastbound exit radius to encourage slower speeds exiting the roundabout;
- Appropriate warning signage in the area (side road junction signage);
- Changes to the road markings and carriageway surface texture and colour to calm traffic in the area including central hatched lining;
- Speed limit signs on the exit to the roundabout to reinforce the need to reduce speed when leaving the A1237.
- Extension to the widened northern footway to narrow the road width in the area and provide adequate space for a shared pedestrian/cycling facility.
- Provision of an inbound cycle lane on the carriageway to Beckfield Lane.
- Accommodation works to adjacent properties where required

73. It is anticipated that the measures proposed to be introduced in the area will lead to lower speeds. Speed levels will be surveyed following construction and the speed limit will be

reviewed and lowered if this can be achieved within national guidelines.

74. A Construction Environmental Management Plan will be agreed with the contractor to control construction traffic. This will cover hours of operation, access routes, traffic management requirements and noise and vibration monitoring and controls

Suggesting rail based Park & Ride

75. A number of residents asked why rail based Park & Ride hadn't been taken forward instead given the existing rail station in Poppleton.

Officers Response

76. The potential for a future rail connection was considered as part of the original site selection process but was not one of the principal criteria. The number of potential Park & Ride site locations immediately adjacent to the A59/A1237 junction and Harrogate line and away from residential properties with the potential for future expansion are very limited. A station further away from York would not cater for the full anticipated market of the proposed Park & Ride site which is also expected to serve travellers from the A1237.
77. The principal reasons for not progressing a rail option using the existing Poppleton station are cost and rail capacity. The Harrogate Line does not currently have capacity to accommodate the frequency required for a successful Park & Ride service (10-15minute). There is a conflict with the East Coast Main Line as the service runs into the North of York Station. A route into the south of the station via the Freight Avoiding Lines would require the construction of an additional line and possibly a new platform. Any improvements would need to be part of an overall Harrogate Line improvement potentially costing £100m+.
78. The down time for the level crossing would also be substantially higher. The operating cost of a dedicated shuttle service would be much higher than a bus based operation and is unlikely to be covered by fare revenue from the anticipated passenger numbers. Upgraded parking provision at stations

along the route could form part of the overall upgrade of the Harrogate Line service.

Too close to Rawcliffe Bar

79. Some respondents questioned the need for a new Park & Ride site so close to the existing Rawcliffe Bar site.

Officers Response

80. As the Poppleton Bar site serves the last A road into York without a Park & ride site it will effectively serve a significantly separate market. The site will principally serve travellers from the North and West accessing the city centre and Holgate Park areas currently using the A59.
81. The new site will reduce the number vehicles on the busiest section of the ring road from the A59 to A19 due to abstraction of existing users from Rawcliffe Bar. It will also reduce the need for commuters to drive directly to the Holgate Park area reducing traffic levels on Boroughbridge Road. The site will also minimise the impact of the proposed housing and employment growth at York Central and British Sugar along the A59 corridor.

Thinks subway is a good idea

82. More respondents were in favour of the subway than against.

Officers Response

83. None needed.

Plant more trees on site

Some local residents were concerned about the level of screening and protection offered through tree planting.

Officers Response

84. The trees shown on the consultation were not as comprehensive as the indicative landscape architecture designs drawn up in 2009, and were only intended to show where some planting may take place close to the junctions. A lack of space in the consultation leaflet prevented more detail being shown.

85. The detailed landscape design of the site is being developed as part of the detailed design. A full and varied mixture of woodland areas, species rich grasslands, aquatic plants, hedges and trees using native species will be planted to screen the site and preserve the rural appearance as much as possible.